

REPORT OF THE DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT MANAGER ON APPEALS

The following appeals have been lodged with the Authority and the current position of each is as follows:-

<u>EC21/0041</u>	Installation of four rooflights within the front roof slope elevation and the erection of a glass balustrade along the front boundary forecourt - Cambrian House, Settlands Hill, Little Haven, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire, SA62 3LA
Type	Written Reps
Current Position	The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW
<u>EC21/0097</u>	Unauthorised change of use of land from agricultural to residential - OS Field No.'s 6881 & 7878 north of Ffynnonwen, Brynberian, Crymych, Pembrokeshire, SA41 3UB
Type	Written Reps
Current Position	The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW
<u>EC21/0145</u>	Construction of new access and access track; erection of timber cabin for residential use; storing of touring caravan; storing of converted van type vehicle; erection of solar panels & erection of tented canopy - Land OS Parcel No. 1050, known as Pwllau Clau, Crosswell, Crymych, Pembrokeshire, SA41 3SA
Type	Written Reps
Current Position	The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW
<u>EC22/0024</u>	Erection and siting of summerhouse/shed - Land referred to as Llainfach, northwest of Carnhedryn Uchaf, near St Davids, Pembrokeshire
Type	Written Reps
Current Position	The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW
<u>NP/24/0005/FUL</u>	Proposed first floor roof extension, new entrance porch, replacement side extension and solar panels - The Champions, Nolton Haven, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire, SA62 3NH
Type	Written Reps
Current Position	The appeal has been dismissed and a copy of the Inspectors decision is attached for your information

NP/23/0556/FUL Retention of residential annex and residential curtilage extension - Leet Cottage, Little Haven, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire, SA62 3UH
Type Written Reps
Current Position The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW

NP/23/0356/DPO Discharge of Section 106 to remove the agricultural occupancy restriction in legal agreement relating to NP/99/0537 & NP/99/0122 – White Moor Farm, Manorbier, Tenby, Pembrokeshire, SA70 7SN
Type Written Reps
Current Position The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW

NP/23/0333/PNA Proposed welfare shed/dry room building - Little Portclew Farm, Chapel Lane, Freshwater East, Pembroke, Pembrokeshire, SA71 5LB
Type Written Reps
Current Position The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW

NP/23/0124/FUL Change of use of surplus public toilets to takeaway ice cream parlour/coffee bar & beach themed retail with small rear extension to create kitchen together with new public disabled toilet as required by Pembrokeshire County Council - Redundant Toilet Block, Adjacent to Newgale Campsite, Newgale, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire, SA62 6AS
Type Written Reps
Current Position The initial documentation has been forwarded to PEDW



Appeal Decision

by Helen Smith BA(Hons) BTP MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Welsh Ministers

Decision date: 13/08/2024

Appeal reference: CAS-03405-N7W7L9

Site address: The Campions, U3091 Folkeston Road to Nolton Haven, Nolton Haven, Haverfordwest, SA62 3NH

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Mr and Mrs Edwards against the decision of Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority.
 - The application Ref NP/24/0005/FUL, dated 2 January 2024, was refused by notice dated 26 March 2024.
 - The development proposed is first floor roof extension, new entrance porch, replacement side extension and solar panels.
 - A site visit was made on 3 July 2024.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Main Issues

2. The main issues are the effect of the proposal on a) the character and appearance of the surrounding area, having regard to its location within the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park (PCNP); and b) biodiversity interests.

Reasons

Character and appearance

3. The appeal relates to a detached bungalow located within the countryside, adjacent to Nolton Haven. The hamlet of Nolton Haven is located at the end of a valley which leads to the coast and the beach flanked by the rugged coastal headlands. Nolton Haven and its surroundings is characterised by sporadic groups of simple small scale traditional cottage style dwellings nestled within the landscape surrounded by scrub and heathland, giving it an attractive coastal setting. Although the Mariners Inn is larger in scale than the surrounding dwellings when viewed from the public car park, due to its traditional appearance and simple pitched roofs, it does not detract from its setting. The appeal site sits in an elevated position above Nolton Haven with expansive views towards the coastline and has a strong visual connection with the coast. It is therefore in a visually

sensitive location. Whilst there is a small caravan site to the northeast of the appeal site, due to the low-lying nature of the caravans, they do not dominate the wider landscape and do not significantly detract from the wider views of the landscape from the coast.

4. The appeal site comprises a detached 'L' shaped bungalow with a garage and store to the rear linked to the dwelling by its roof, and a swimming pool to the southwest of the bungalow. It is set within a spacious garden which slopes down to the southeastern boundary. The host dwelling has no particular architectural merit, however, owing to its low profile and modest appearance, the bungalow currently has a neutral impact on its rural surroundings. Owing to the topography of the area, the southwestern element of the bungalow is visually prominent when viewed from the public car park and from wider views from the coast.
5. The National Park Authority (NPA) have raised no concerns in regard to the proposed entrance porch, replacement side extension and the solar panels and having regard to the small scale of these elements of the proposal, I do not disagree. However, although the proposed first floor roof extension would not be higher than the ridge of the existing pitched roof of the dwelling, it would introduce an additional storey to the bungalow which, together with its flat roof, would fundamentally alter the simple and modest profile of the existing dwelling, significantly adding to its massing and bulk. This would result in a large scale and overtly bulky and boxy addition, unsympathetic to the existing low profile dwelling and would be in stark contrast to the character of the modest dwellings in the vicinity of the appeal site.
6. The proposed first floor extension would be sited on the most visually prominent part of the dwelling. Consequently, its scale, bulk and unsympathetic appearance would be visible in its wider setting and it would be viewed against the backdrop of the surrounding rural landscape. It would draw the eye of the observer, particularly from the public car park and the coast to the southwest. Although the dwelling is sited lower than the adjacent road to the northeast, as the increase in the scale and bulk would be at the first floor level, much of its scale and bulk would be visible above the site's boundary fence and from the gated driveway.
7. A Visual Impact Assessment was carried out, however, this assessment was based on limited viewpoints and therefore fails to fully assess the likely impacts of the proposal on the landscape. I recognise that a sensitive material palette, including a green roof and green living wall, could harmonise with the natural surrounding landscape. Nevertheless, this would do little to mitigate the scale and bulk of the proposed first floor extension. Consequently, the proposal would result in a visually dominant and incongruous development which would be unsympathetic to the character and appearance of its rural village coastal setting and the wider rural landscape. This would have a harmful effect on the special qualities of the PCNP.
8. The appellant has drawn my attention to examples of contemporary dwellings in the PCNP and other locations in Pembrokeshire, Swansea and England. However, whilst they are similar to the appeal proposal in that they are of a contemporary design, the full site context and circumstances of those developments are not before me and it would be rare that such circumstances would be exactly the same as the appeal proposal. I have therefore determined the appeal on its own merits.
9. I conclude that the proposed development would cause material harm to the character and appearance of the surrounding area and would fail to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the PCNP. It would therefore be contrary to Policies 8 and 14 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan 2 (LDP), and LDP Policies 29 and 30 which seek to ensure all proposals are well designed and do not have an unacceptable adverse effect on people's enjoyment of the quality of the environment. It

also runs contrary to the objectives of Planning Policy Wales Edition 12 (PPW) and the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority's Sustainable Design and Development Supplementary Planning Guidance, which seeks to promote high quality, sustainable design that enhances the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park.

Biodiversity interests

10. PPW aims to protect and enhance habitats and biodiversity and to improve the overall resilience of ecosystems through a stepwise approach and advises that a Green Infrastructure Statement (GIS) should be submitted with all planning applications which should be proportionate to the scale and nature of the development proposed. It recognises that green roofs and green walls can contribute to green infrastructure networks and that green roofs are an example of individual design measures that can have wider cumulative effects. LDP Policy 11, is consistent with the aims of PPW.
11. A GIS was submitted with the appeal and sets out the incorporation of a green roof, living green wall and biodiversity enhancements consisting of the provision of a bird nest box and a bat box into the proposal. Whilst a step wise approach is not explicitly set out, taking a proportionate approach, and given the nature of the proposed alterations, there is limited opportunity to integrate green infrastructure through appropriate site selection. Nevertheless, through design the proposed green roof and living green wall would benefit the ecological connectivity of the site and contribute to the green infrastructure network, subject to appropriate native planting which could be secured by condition. Although the NPA refer to the removal of a section of hedgerow elsewhere on the site and its replacement with a fence, this does not form part of the appeal proposal and is not required to facilitate the appeal scheme. I also note that the NPA suggest conditions to ensure existing natural features are protected and where necessary enhanced.
12. In these circumstances, and on the available information, I find that the proposal would secure biodiversity enhancements to provide a net benefit in compliance with LDP Policy 11 and PPW.

Conclusion

13. Although I have concluded that there would be no harm to biodiversity interests, this does not outweigh the significant harm to the character and appearance of the area, which is an overriding consideration. For the reasons set out above, and having regard to all matters raised, I conclude that the appeal should be dismissed.
14. In reaching my decision, I have taken into account the requirements of sections 3 and 5 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. I consider that this decision is in accordance with the Act's sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers' well-being objectives.

H Smith

INSPECTOR